

A Delphi-Based Analysis for Expert Consensus: Towards Effective Marketing Message Strategies in the Aftermath of Tourism Crises in Egypt

Amany N. Beshay

Associate Professor, Tourism Studies Department

Faculty of Tourism and Hotels, Alexandria University, Egypt

Nermin A. Morsy

Associate Professor, Tourism Studies Department

Faculty of Tourism and Hotels, Alexandria University, Egypt

Abstract

This paper provides a perception of the best strategies to communicate with the tourism markets in the aftermath of crises which is critical for tourism destinations that seek to repair their image and reputation. Marketing recovery message strategies are crucial in managing the misperceptions and media-imposed attitudes held within the potential markets. This paper reports the results of a conventional Delphi technique study with tourism experts from both academia and industry. The objective was to identify key types of post-crises destination marketing messages that prove effective in cultivating a positive image of Egypt, a destination vulnerable to crises from 2011 until 2023. The outcomes of this paper contribute to the existing literature and benefit destination management organizations by outlining key features of message strategies. This information can guide destination marketers in planning effective post-crises recovery campaigns.

Keywords: Delphi technique, Destination recovery, Destination image repair, Marketing message strategies, Egyptian tourism crises.

1. Introduction

The global tourism industry is vulnerable in nature to countless challenges, ranging from natural disasters and pandemics to political unrest and acts of terrorism. When destinations experience crises, the effective communication of recovery messages becomes crucial in restoring their image and reputation. In the aftermath of crises, the perceptions held by potential tourists are critical, necessitating well-crafted marketing recovery messages to manage misperceptions and counter negative views promoted by international media. An effective response can maintain the destination's reputation, reduce the negative impact of the disaster (Coombs, 2014), and positively influence visitors' travel intentions (Penco *et al.*, 2019). This paper specifically explores post-crisis destination

marketing message strategies, with a particular focus on Egypt, a nation that has faced various challenges and vulnerabilities since 2011.

While a number of studies have conducted retrospective analyses of destinations' responses and recovery (Le & Phi, 2021; Novelli *et al.*, 2018; Ou & Wong, 2021; Pan *et al.*, 2021), most of the studies on tourism crises tended to concentrate on individual post-crisis case studies, often lacking a comprehensive long-term analysis of image restoration strategies throughout the years. These studies which have mainly focused on events such as pandemics and terrorist attacks, natural disasters like earthquakes and tsunamis, as well as weather-related incidents like floods and storms, have often missed studying topics such as media exaggeration, inadequate communication among stakeholders, and the critical role of selecting effective marketing messaging (Mair *et al.*, 2016).

Moreover, there is a notable gap in the literature regarding the specific area of marketing communication for post-crises destination recovery (Wang & Lopez, 2020). Particularly, limited research has examined strategic communications from a multi-crisis perspective (Avraham, 2020).

In this context, this study aims to address this gap by presenting the outcomes of a conventional Delphi technique survey, engaging tourism experts from academia and industry. The aim is to determine the key types of post-crises destination marketing messages that prove effective in cultivating a positive image of Egypt in the aftermath of

crises. Additionally, the study aims to assess the efficacy of the message strategies that Egypt has already employed from 2011 to 2023. This study contributes to both existing literature and destination management organizations by defining key features of effective message strategies. These insights serve as valuable guidance for destination marketers in the meticulous planning of post-crises recovery campaigns.

In order to achieve the study objectives, the following research questions were articulated:

- a. What should be the objectives of recovery marketing strategies in the aftermath of tourism crises?
- b. What are the marketing message features that can effectively communicate recovery and restore tourists' confidence during and after crises?
- c. Which marketing message strategies has Egypt previously employed in the aftermath of tourism crises and how effective were they in restoring confidence and attracting tourists back to the destination?

In tackling the research questions, this study employs the Delphi technique to reach a consensus among tourism experts from academia and industry. The Delphi technique is a systematic approach to reaching consensus on a specific topic by gathering and analyzing the opinions of a panel of experts. Through multiple rounds of questionnaires, experts provide responses that are aggregated and shared with the panelists after each round (Hasson, 2000). The experts can adjust their answers each round, based on how they interpret the group response provided to them, aiming to unite towards a true consensus on

the studied topic (Hall, 2009). The choice of employing this method is grounded in the recognition that determining which marketing messages are appropriate and effective for the restoration of destination image relies significantly on the expert judgmental information (Okoli and Pawlowski, 2004). The principal goal of this study is to construct a forward-looking vision, drawing extensively upon the wealth of experience and expertise held by the participating experts. In this sense, the Delphi technique manages the delicate balance of seeking valuable insights without subjecting the experts to direct confrontation, thus easing the potential formation of biased opinions (Hall, 2009). This approach is influential in creating an environment where experts can share their ideas openly while keeping their perspectives respected (Szpilko, 2014). A comprehensive discussion of the Delphi technique employed in this study, along with a breakdown of its various rounds, will be provided in the methodology section of this research.

2. Literature Review

2.1. Impacts of Crises on Tourism Destinations

Tourism destinations worldwide have experienced significant disruptions due to various crises, ranging from natural disasters and health emergencies to political unrest and terrorist attacks. For instance, the global COVID-19 pandemic, which emerged in late 2019, brought international travel to a near standstill, severely impacting destinations reliant on tourism revenue. Countries such as Italy, renowned for its cultural heritage and scenic beauty, witnessed a sharp decline in tourist arrivals, leading to economic hardships for local businesses and communities (Singh & Sahu, 2022). Similarly, the terrorist attacks

in Sri Lanka in 2019 targeted popular tourist hubs, including hotels and churches, resulting in a substantial decrease in visitor numbers and damaging the country's image as a safe and welcoming destination (Isaac & Van den Bedem, 2021).

These crises not only disrupt the flow of tourists but also undermine destination branding efforts, erode consumer confidence, and pose long-term challenges for recovery and rebuilding. For instance, the Fukushima nuclear disaster in Japan in 2011 had lasting implications for the country's tourism industry, with concerns about radiation levels discouraging visitors from areas far beyond the affected region (Cheng *et al.*, 2015; Handler, 2016). Moreover, political instability and civil unrest, such as the protests of January 2011 in Egypt or those of Hong Kong in 2019, can harm a destination's reputation for safety and stability, preventing potential visitors and causing significant economic consequences (Avraham, 2015; Poon, & Koay, 2021). In summary, crises impose complex impacts on tourism destinations, affecting their economic capabilities, image perception, and long-term sustainability, necessitating strategic interventions and resilience-building measures to navigate the challenges effectively.

It is noteworthy that the impact of crises on the tourism market is frequently disproportionate to their actual disruptive effects due to media exaggeration (Khazai *et al.*, 2018). Negative media coverage intensifies the damage, leading to a damaged destination image (Karimi *et al.*, 2022). Consequently, the recovery of destinations often extends beyond the time required to normalize services (Faulkner, 2001). The efficiency of a disaster-affected tourism industry in managing a crisis, particularly

through a crisis communication strategy, significantly influences the speed of destination restoration and business recovery (Backer & Brent, 2017; Becken & Khazai, 2017). International media reports have the potential to severely impact disaster-affected destinations, posing a considerable challenge to the marketability of a destination and even triggering collateral marketing crises in neighbouring destinations that might have nothing to do with the crisis (Beirman, 2016). Therefore, destination marketing organizations (DMOs) must develop targeted communication plans and strategies to address media reports and directly respond to tourists' concerns following disasters and crises. The effectiveness of a crisis communication strategy in managing risk perception largely depends on the extent to which communication plans have been integrated into crises management policies and strategies, enabling the industry to convey accurate positive and influencing messages to the market (Coombs, 2014; Avraham, 2015).

2.2. Crisis Communication and Image Repair

Crisis communication strategies involve destination image repair in the aftermath of crises. The image repair theory is a communication theory that focuses on how individuals or organizations respond to and manage damage to their reputation or public image. This theory developed by Benoit (1995) provides a framework for understanding the strategies that entities employ to repair or restore their image when facing accusations, crises, or negative publicity.

The central assumption of image repair theory is that individuals or organizations are motivated to protect their reputation, and

when their image is threatened, they engage in communication strategies to repair the damage. Benoit (1995) identified five primary image repair strategies that individuals or organizations may use. Firstly, denial: negating the allegations or denying responsibility for the actions that led to the damage. Secondly, evasion of responsibility: acknowledging the issue but deflecting blame by emphasizing external factors or uncontrollable circumstances. Thirdly, reducing offensiveness: attempting to downplay the severity of the actions or framing them in a less negative light. Fourthly, corrective action: taking tangible steps to address the issue, rectify the harm caused, and prevent future occurrences. Lastly, mortification: admitting fault, expressing remorse, and seeking forgiveness without making excuses.

These strategies can be employed individually or in combination, depending on the nature of the situation and the goals of the communicator (Hassan, 2019). Image repair theory is commonly applied in public relations, crisis communication, and organizational communication contexts to analyse how individuals and organizations respond to reputational threats and attempt to restore their standing in the eyes of the public.

Destination marketers and tourism boards may turn to image repair strategies to rebuild and restore the destination's image after crises (Khazai *et al.*, 2018; Singh *et al.*, 2022). The application of image repair theory in this context involves crafting communication messages and campaigns that address the negative perceptions and concerns surrounding the destination (Scott *et al.*, 2008; Walters & Mair, 2014; Yeh, 2021). It is noteworthy that the post-crises communication scene goes beyond simple

image repair, extending to convey the assurance of safety and security for future visitors, alongside promoting tourism and renewal (Oliveira & Huertas, 2019; Ulmer *et al.*, 2007).

Several destinations have successfully applied image repair strategies following crises to rebuild their reputations and attract visitors. In the aftermath of the 2004 Indian Ocean tsunami, Thailand implemented measures to enhance safety, rebuild infrastructure, and convey its recovery efforts through marketing campaigns, emphasizing the resilience of the destination (Taecharungroj & Avraham, 2022). Similarly, New Orleans in USA faced a decline in tourism after Hurricane Katrina in 2005 (Gotham, 2017), but utilized image repair strategies by investing in rebuilding, highlighting cultural attractions, and showcasing the city's recovery progress, especially during events (Ryu *et al.*, 2013). Japan, after the 2011 earthquake, tsunami, and nuclear disaster, focused on promoting safety, cultural attractions, and recovery efforts through the "Visit Japan" campaign (Cheng *et al.*, 2015). New Zealand, employed image repair tactics following earthquakes in 2010 and 2011, emphasizing reconstruction, promoting new attractions, and showcasing the community's resilience to restore its image as a vibrant destination (Fountain & Cradock-Henry, 2020). These examples highlight how destinations have effectively utilized image repair theory to overcome the challenges posed by crises.

Destination image repair or restoration is recognized as a critical aspect of long-term tourism development following a crisis (Ritchie & Jiang, 2021). The process of restoring a destination to its pre-crisis or improved state, known as post-crisis destination recovery, involves planning and

executing measures for recovery (Walters & Mair, 2014). Marketing effectiveness and the restoration of safety perceptions are identified as key determinants influencing tourism recovery rates (Becken & Hughey, 2013; Biran *et al.*, 2014). Media relations between tourist crisis management authorities and tourism markets are acknowledged as crucial in this process (Baalbaki & Zizka, 2023).

2.3. Crises Recovery Marketing Messages

For recovery marketing messages, Walters and Mair (2012) categorize nine different types of messages that businesses can utilize, including testimonials, business as usual, community preparedness, celebrity endorsement, solidarity appeal, turning a negative image into an asset, short-term discounts, and enhancing curiosity. Additionally, a multi-step approach for destination image modification has been proposed, suggesting various messaging strategies such as tackling the disaster, limiting, or downsizing its scope, delivering a counter-message, partnering with well-known companies and celebrities, and turning liabilities into assets (Avraham, 2016; Avraham & Ketter, 2017).

In the case of Egypt and within the past thirteen years of various crises affecting tourism, media strategies have been employed to manage the narrative surrounding safety concerns, particularly the perception that "Egypt is not safe" (Avraham, 2016). To counteract this negative image, Egypt strategically hosted international sporting events like the 2019 African Cup of Nations (AFCON) and promoted sports tourism through events like "The Pyramids Marathon" (Baalbaki & Zizka, 2023). The goal was not only to boost tourism but also to reshape the media narrative in a more positive light.

Moreover, during the COVID-19 pandemic, Egypt's Ministry of Tourism and Antiquities utilized media communication to convey their efforts in safeguarding visitors. Micro-film promotions with the hashtag #VisitEgyptSoon were launched to assure tourists of safety measures, and hotels adhering to compliance were granted permission to operate with limited occupancy (Fakhry, 2022).

Maher and El Fkharany (2022) explored the interconnected concepts of image repair and tourist identity within Egyptian tourism marketing. The study reveals that a destination's perceived image significantly influences tourists' sense of belonging and connection to the place. The findings emphasize the need for an integrated marketing approach that addresses negative image associations while reinforcing the destination's unique identity. Evaluating the efforts of Egyptian DMOs, the research identifies areas for improvement in fully incorporating image repair and identity confirmation into marketing strategies, attributing this deficiency to the slower-than-desired recovery of Egyptian tourism. Recommendations include a marketing shift that combines both elements, a focus on Egypt's cultural heritage to strengthen its identity, and collaborative efforts among DMOs, tourism stakeholders, and local communities to ensure a consistent and compelling message.

Furthermore, Fakhry (2022) explored how tourism advertising can help protect a country's image during crises, using Egypt as a case study. In times of trouble, advertising strategies should adapt to tackle negative perceptions and rebuild trust. Fakhry suggests a few key strategies, like shifting focus from the usual "Sun, Sea, and Sand" to showcasing cultural heritage and unique experiences,

creating an emotional connection with potential tourists through storytelling and visuals, being open and honest about the situation, and using various channels to communicate effectively. This research adds to the understanding that, during tough times, advertising not only needs to fix the image but also highlight the unique identity of a destination, using emotional appeal and clear communication to build trust and support a resilient and sustainable tourism industry.

Moreover, in a recent study conducted by Baalbaki and Zizka (2023), the impact of recurring crises (like the Arab Spring and COVID-19) on Egypt's destination brand image was examined. The study revealed that Egypt's tourism image tends to suffer during crises; however, it exhibits significant resilience and the capacity to bounce back. The study also highlights the significance of effective crisis communication as a critical factor. By proactively managing perceptions and maintaining a positive image, Egypt can moderate the damage of crises and lay the foundation for faster recovery.

3. Research Methodology

For the exploratory objectives of this study, the Delphi approach has been deployed, first to identify the most efficient types of marketing recovery messages in general, then to reach agreement on the most appropriate messages strategies for Egypt. The Delphi method is based on questioning a specific group of experts at least twice (Szpilko, 2014). Experts respond to a few rounds of questionnaires and the responses are aggregated and shared with the panelists after each round. The experts can adjust their answers each round, based on how they interpret the group response provided to them (Hasson, 2000). Within the study, the Delphi

process gathers qualitative information in the scoping round (round1, R1), followed by scoring and rating in the convergence rounds (mostly rounds 2 and 3), to conclude with consensus at the end (Garrod and Fyall, 2005; Hall, 2009).

The study applied the Delphi method's four principles that comprise: participants are a group of experts, selected because of their expertise related to the study phenomenon; multiple interactions through which expert opinions are gathered and a consensus is reached; feedback applied to the participants to achieve interaction and reflection; and lastly, expert opinions, which contribute to the solution of a given problem or predicting the future (Plummer & Armitage, 2007).

Although an important component of a competent Delphi panel is its size (Zhang *et*

al., 2021), the Delphi group size is determined by group dynamics, not statistical power, to reach consensus among experts (Okoli and Pawlowski, 2004). As stated by McCleary and Whitney (1994), a balanced panel ought to consist of a minimum of ten experts from both academic and industry backgrounds. Okoli and Pawlowski (2004) indicated that literature recommends 10–18 experts on a Delphi panel. According to Lin *et al.* (2015), panel sizes for Delphi technique uses in tourism studies needs to include minimum 6 experts.

Therefore, to modify the initial projections of the study, a Delphi panel of 40 experts, based on the established criteria for a balanced panel, has been chosen. As shown in table (1), there has been certain criteria for experts' inclusion.

Table (1) Inclusion Criteria of Panel Experts

Panelist type		Qualification
Academic experts		15+ years of teaching and research experience at a university.
		Interest areas include marketing, destination marketing, crisis communication, and/or marketing communications.
Industry experts	Private sector	10+ years of experience in current position.
		Now holding a prominent position in the tourism and hospitality sector.
		Individuals in a decision-making capacity at NTOs or DMOs.
		Role as a consultant within the public sector.

Initially, individual contacts have been made with the 40 participants. The nature of the study and its goals have been elaborated.

Subsequently, the survey rounds have been distributed as online forms for completion, as

this format is more precise, efficient, and capable of handling data analysis.

The initial phase of the survey (R1) consisted of open-ended questions about enumerating the primary messaging strategies' objectives and the kinds of messages that each strategy contained. Eleven sorts of recovery marketing messages and four major specified objectives were identified within R1.

The second phase (R2) of the survey included the most frequent eleven sorts of recovery marketing messages and four major specified objectives within the initial phase. R2 main purpose was to confirm R1 findings, by rating the importance of the strategies objectives, determining the level of appropriateness of each message feature as well as the efficiency level of each Egyptian recovery message (nine main themes from the messages that Egypt has sent amid crises during the past thirteen years were also comprised). Besides, there was also an open-ended section in the R2 survey where participants may provide any last thoughts or recommendations. Verifying panel consensus and validating the list of the strategy objectives, key message elements and past Egyptian messages efficiency were the main objectives of (R3).

The first round was analyzed qualitatively by using content analysis, the most frequent themes regarding the objectives of marketing recovery strategies, main features of recovery message strategies as well as primary themes from Egypt's crisis communications throughout the previous thirteen years were compiled from R1. The researchers have paired the responses with the prior literature to identify precise and clear marketing

strategy objectives and recovery marketing features to be included within the next round (R2).

With respect to the previously delivered Egyptian recovery messages, the themes identified in the second round have been extracted through an in-depth search for varied messages that appeared from 2011 to 2023 on different platforms and campaigns (see Table 6). The search included for instance, the websites of Egypt Independent, ETN (Eturbonews), and the Egyptian Ministry of Tourism...etc (Egypt Independent, 2023; ETN, 2023; Ministry of Tourism & Antiquities, 2023).

In the next two rounds, Likert scales were employed in survey questions to assess the appropriateness of the features of recovery message strategies. Additionally, experts were asked to rate the efficiency of the recovery messages used by Egypt over the past thirteen years.

Data from round two and three was analysed using SPSS. The formula of mean, mode, median and standard deviation have been used to analyse the experts' responses in order to understand the tendency and the distribution of the data. Additionally, the variation and deviation of data have been measured using the standard deviation. The semi-interquartile range was also calculated to have an accurate perspective of data spread and to measure the statistical variance.

4. Data Analysis & Results

The study presents the results of a three-round Delphi survey conducted into experts' opinion on the Egyptian recovery messages strategies. Table 2 shows the profile and number of experts participating in each round.

Table (2) Profile of Delphi Expert Panelists

Expert Panelists	Round 1 (R1)		Round 2 (R2)		Round 3 (R3)	
	Frequency	Percent	Frequency	Percent	Frequency	Percent
Academic Experts	13	37.1	12	35.1	11	34.4
Industry Experts (Officials)	10	28.6	9	24.3	8	25
Industry Experts (Private sector)	17	48.6	16	43.2	13	40.6
Total	40	100	37	100	32	100

A total of 40 experts responded in the primary round, out of which 37 participated in the second round and 32 in the final one, resulting in an 80 % response rate and an 20% attrition rate from first to last round. The panel for the first round comprised 27 (67.5%) industry experts (Private sector and officials) and 13 (32.5%) academic experts. For the second one, there were 25 (67.5%) industry experts and 12 (32.5%) academic experts. While, within round three, 21 (65.6%) industry experts and 11 (34.4%) academic experts.

Table (3) Experience of Panelists

Years of Experience	Frequency	Percent
10 to 15years	4	10.8
15 to 25 years	12	32.3
More than 25 years	21	56.8
Total	37	100.0

Every expert within the panellists worked in their respective fields (Table 3) for more than 10 years (University professors, Hotels managers, travel agencies owners and managers, tourist guides, officials within the Egyptian Ministry of Tourism and the Egyptian Tourist Authority) with experience

in the field of destination marketing and communication strategies as presented in (Table 1).

Table (4) Objectives of Recovery Marketing Strategies (R1)

Recovery Marketing Strategies	Frequency	Rank
Change any false perceptions	18	1
Adress the tourists' concerns	16	2
Reinforce positive perceptions	16	2
Alter the travel intension	7	3

The expert panel has decided that the primary goal of any recovery marketing strategy should be to change the incorrect perceptions, as table (4) illustrates. This came in line with Fakhry (2022) who asserts that strategies should adapt to tackle negative perceptions and rebuild trust. Addressing the concern of the tourists and promoting favourable views were ranked in the second level. This came along with (Haunge *et al.*, 2008). Altering, tourists' travel intentions, have been ranked lowest by experts, although this was

especially important for a significant health calamity like the COVID-19 pandemic. The avoidance of travel, as demonstrated by Zheng et al. (2021), can be a common response to a general fear of traveling,

prompting protective actions. Wang and Lopez (2020) discovered that safety messages used in advertising destinations encouraged visit intentions.

Table (5) Analysis of Expert Consensus on Main Features of Recovery Message Strategies (R2)

Message	Mean	Median	Mode	Std. Deviation	Semi Interquartile Range	Skewness	Std. Error of Skewness	Kurtosis	Std. Error of Kurtosis	Percentiles		
										25	50	75
"Destination as usual"	3.20	3.00	3	1.183	1	.154	.398	-.795	.778	2	3	4
"Limiting the crisis"	2.83	3.00	3	1.294	1	.079	.398	-.988	.778	2	3	4
"Admitting the negative image"	2.89	3.00	2	1.367	1	.218	.398	-1.162	.778	2	3	4
"Hosting spotlight sports and cultural events"	4.17	4.00	5	.985	0.5	-.952	.398	-.144	.778	4	4	5
"Geographic disassociation from problematic areas"	3.40	4.00	4	1.143	0.5	-.366	.398	-.598	.778	3	4	4
"Association with well-known brands and celebrities"	4.20	4.00	5	.994	0.5	-1.379	.398	1.949	.778	4	4	5
"Back to business"	3.66	4.00	4	1.187	1	-.622	.398	-.382	.778	3	4	5
"Testimonies from Tourists"	4.11	4.00	5	1.051	1	-.885	.398	-.460	.778	3	4	5
"Short-term discounts"	3.20	3.00	4	1.256	0.5	-.590	.398	-.572	.778	3	3	4
"Appeal to visitors' empathy"	2.94	3.00	3	1.162	1	-.003	.398	-.797	.778	2	3	4
"Curiosity enhancing"	3.54	4.00	4	1.039	0.5	-.622	.398	.442	.778	3	4	4
"Turning the unfavorable image into assets"	3.86	4.00	4	.974	1	-.912	.398	.980	.778	3	4	5
"Restoring Confidence"	4.34	5.00	5	.906	0.5	-1.264	.398	.739	.778	4	5	5
No. Of Valid Data	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37

In round two, the experts were asked to rank the features of the recovery marketing strategies according to their appropriateness as a strong tool for post-crisis recovery in Egypt. The quantitative responses underwent descriptive analysis, calculating the percentage of panelists who agreed that each characteristic was appropriate by combining

the responses for "appropriate" and "strongly appropriate." As shown in Table 5, the features with strong agreement (Mode=5) are "Restoring Confidence" with a mean of 4.34 and a standard deviation of .906; "Association with well-known brands and celebrities" with a mean of 4.20 and a standard deviation of .994; and "Hosting spotlight sports and

cultural events" with a mean of 4.17 and a standard deviation of .985 suggesting consistency in the data and higher percentiles (25=4, 50=5, 75=5) or(25=4, 50=4, 75=5), where 4=appropriate and 5=strongly appropriate.

It appears that all highly rated features indirectly emphasize safety perceptions, a key determinant influencing tourism recovery rates, as stated by Becken & Hughey (2013) and Biran *et al.* (2014). Ryu *et al.* (2013) also highlighted the idea of utilizing image repair strategies by investing in rebuilding, highlighting cultural attractions, and showcasing the city's recovery progress, especially during events.

Conversely, three features demonstrated moderate agreement. The features with moderate agreement (Mode =4) are "Short-term discounts" with a mean of (3.20) and a standard deviation of 1.256; "Curiosity enhancing" with a mean of (3.54) and a standard deviation of 1.039, and "Geographic disassociation from problematic areas" with a mean of (3.40) and a standard deviation of 1.143, indicating consistency in the data and moderate percentiles (25=3, 50=3, 75=4) or (25=3, 50=4, 75=4), where 3=neutral and 4=appropriate. This suggests that all moderate agreement features fall between neutral and appropriate.

Table (6) Analysis of Expert Consensus on Past Egyptian Recovery Messages (R2)

Message	Mean	Median	Mode	Std. Deviation	Semi Interquartile Range	Skewness	Std. Error of Skewness	Kurtosis	Std. Error of Kurtosis	Percentiles		
										25	50	75
"Egypt as usual"	2.37	2.00	3	1.165	1	.508	.398	-.356	.778	1	2	3
"Luxor is stable & secure"	3.34	3.00	3	.998	0.5	.180	.398	-.961	.778	3	3	4
"We are Egypt, see you soon in Egypt"	3.54	4.00	4	1.268	1	-.606	.398	-.634	.778	3	4	5
"Egypt is Safe"	3.43	4.00	4	1.170	0.5	-.693	.398	-.337	.778	3	4	4
"Tour 'n' Cure"	3.74	4.00	4	.980	0.5	-.834	.398	.664	.778	3	4	4
"Will Smith visits Egypt's Giza pyramids"	4.20	4.00	5	.901	0.5	-1.443	.398	3.181	.778	4	4	5
"The African Cup of Nations (AFCON)"	4.29	5.00	5	.957	0.5	-1.477	.398	2.486	.778	4	5	5
"Royal Mummies in Golden Parade" & "Sphinx Avenue Grand opening"	4.46	5.00	5	1.120	0.5	-2.215	.398	4.143	.778	4	5	5
"War Will Not Stop Egypt's Tourism Growth"	3.26	3.00	3	1.336	1	-.267	.398	-.907	.778	2	3	4
No. of Valid Data	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37	37

From the perspective of the panelists, Table 6 presents the results regarding the effectiveness of Egyptian recovery messaging utilized in the past thirteen years following various

crises. Strong agreement was associated with messages hosting sports events or mega events to shift the media narrative from negative to positive, as indicated by Baalbaki

& Laura Zizka (2023). It was also recommended that a focus on Egypt's cultural heritage to strengthen its identity is an essential shift for the Egyptian marketing effort (Maher and El Fkharany, 2022). Therefore, the messages "Royal Mummies in Golden Parade" and "Sphinx Avenue Grand opening" had a higher mean of (4.46), and mode of 5 and a standard deviation of 1.120. "The African Cup of Nations (AFCON)" had a mean of (4.29), mode of 5 and a standard deviation of .957 proposing consistency within the data and higher percentiles (25=4, 50=5, 75=5), where 4=efficient and 5=strongly efficient. The message associated with celebrities ("Will Smith visits Egypt's Giza pyramids") had a mean of (4.20), and mode of 5 and a standard deviation of .901 with higher percentiles (25=4, 50=4, 75=5) where 4=efficient and 5=strongly efficient.

Three other messages had a moderate agreement: "Luxor is stable & secure" with a

mean of (3.34), and mode of 4. The standard deviation of this message was .998, proposing consistency within the data and a moderate percentiles range (25=3, 50=3, 75=4), where 3=neutral and 4=appropriate. Both messages "Egypt is Safe" and "Turn N Cure" had the same moderate agreement with means of (3.43 and 3.74 respectively), mode of 4. The standard deviations of these messages were 1.170, and .980 respectively also indicating few spreads with a moderate percentiles range (25=3, 50=4, 75=4), where 3=neutral and 4=appropriate.

By the end of Round two (R2) of the Delphi survey, all features, and messages with high to moderate agreement were removed from the survey. For Round three (R3), expert panelists received a revised survey with the remaining items lacking agreement, along with their Round two responses and key results. They were asked to review and validate their responses for the remaining items. Tables seven and eight present the results of Delphi Round three (R3).

Table (7) Analysis of Expert Consensus on Main Features of Recovery Message Strategies (R3)

Message	Mean	Median	Mode	Std. Deviation	Semi Interquartile Range	Skewness	Std. Error of Skewness	Kurtosis	Std. Error of Kurtosis	Percentiles		
										25	50	75
"Destination as usual"	3.28	3.00	2	1.250	1	-.046	.414	-1.092	.809	2	3	4
"Limiting the crisis"	2.91	3.00	3	1.228	1	.077	.414	-.657	.809	2	3	4
"Admitting the negative image"	3.16	3.50	4	1.483	1	-.286	.414	-1.342	.809	2	3.5	4
"Back to business"	4.03	4.00	5	1.031	1	-1.007	.414	.869	.809	3	4	5
"Testimonies from Tourists"	4.25	5.00	5	.894	0.5	-1.193	.414	.433	.809	4	5	5
"Appeal to visitors' empathy"	3.03	3.00	3	1.092	1	.252	.414	-.352	.809	2	3	4
"Turning the unfavorable image into assets"	3.34	4.00	4	1.310	0.5	-.783	.414	-.375	.809	3	4	4
No. Of Valid Data	32	32	32	32	32	32	32	32	32	32	32	32

Within the Delphi phases, the process of reaching an agreement and retaining certain items/issues is a crucial component of data analysis (Plummer & Armitage, 2007).

Therefore, as illustrated in Table 7, during round three, the only feature of the message strategies that has been reconsidered and widely considered appropriate is "Testimonies

from Tourists," which has a mean of 4.25, mode of 5 and a standard deviation .894 indicating consistency in the data. Additionally, the percentiles (25=4, 50=5, 75=5), where 4=appropriate and 5=strongly appropriate. Other features seem to be neutral to inappropriate; this is evident from the values of the mean, median, and mode formulas. The value of the standard deviation also indicates the variance of the responses. The range within the percentiles is also wide.

Building on the analysis of rounds two and three, it has been revealed that experts did not reach an agreement on five features of recovery message strategies: messages that ask for visitors' empathy; messages that acknowledge the negative image and attempt to turn it into an asset; messages that limit or ignore the crisis. They all have lower means, a broad range of percentiles, and wide semi-interquartile ranges.

Table (8) Analysis of Expert Consensus on Past Egyptian Recovery Messages (R3)

Message	Mean	Median	Mode	Std. Deviation	Interquartile Range	Skewness	Std. Error of Skewness	Kurtosis	Std. Error of Kurtosis	Percentiles		
										25	50	75
"Egypt as usual"	2.56	3.00	1	1.343	1	.285	.414	-1.052	-.809	1	3	3
"We are Egypt, see you soon in Egypt"	3.69	4.00	4	1.203	1	-.770	.414	-.236	-.809	3	4	5
"War Will Not Stop Egypt's Tourism Growth"	3.38	4.00	4	1.264	0.5	-.569	.414	-.524	-.809	3	4	4
No. of Valid Data	32	32	32	32	32	32	32	32	32	32	32	32

Concerning the Egyptian recovery messages that have been used post-crises within the last thirteen years, round three shows no strong reconsideration of the previous round results. The message "War Will Not Stop Egypt's Tourism Growth" had a slight change to moderate agreement; it has a mean of 3.69 instead of 3.54 in round 2, with an increased mode of 4. The percentiles range turned to (25=3, 50=4, 75=4) instead of (25=2, 50=3, 75=4), thus the responses extend between neutral and efficient; before it was wide between inefficient and efficient.

5. Conclusion & Implications

In conclusion, this study, conducted through a three-round Delphi technique with a diverse panel of tourism experts, has uncovered

Extending the insights from rounds two and three, certain messages that have been released from Egypt following specific situations appear ineffective in the opinion of the panelists. The slogans "Egypt as usual" and "We are Egypt, see you soon in Egypt" share a similar viewpoint. These messages ignore the crisis and convey a message that nothing affects the tourism industry. The experts were unable to reach any sort of consensus regarding these two types of messages. They all have larger semi-interquartile ranges, a broader variety of percentiles, and lower means.

valuable insights into effective post-crises destination marketing message strategies. The consensus among experts about marketing message strategies emphasizes the importance

of addressing misperceptions, engaging in mega events, and associating with well-known figures for successful recovery. It is imperative to note that certain messages, including "Destination as usual," "Limiting the crisis," "Admitting the negative image," and "Appeal to visitors' empathy," did not receive expert consensus and should be avoided in future communication strategies.

Regarding the messages disseminated by Egypt over the last thirteen years, a distinct pattern in expert consensus has been revealed. Once again, messages associated with hosting successful mega events, such as The African Cup of Nations, and special tourism events like "Royal Mummies Golden Parade" & "Sphinx Avenue Grand opening," along with connections to mega stars like "Will Smith visits Egypt's Giza pyramids," gathered strong support from experts. These messages strategically aimed to shape the perception of Egypt as a recovered destination and project an image of a revitalized nation. In contrast, certain messages, including "Egypt as usual," and "We are Egypt, see you soon in Egypt," did not receive expert consensus, signaling a need to avoid such communication strategies in future recovery campaigns. This analysis provides valuable insights into the types of messages that resonate positively with experts and, consequently, with potential tourists, contributing to the ongoing efforts of destination recovery and image management.

Acknowledging the exploratory nature of this study and its chosen methodology, certain limitations should be considered in interpreting the findings. The insights derived from the Delphi technique primarily reflect the expert judgment of a single panel. It is essential to recognize that the consensus

reached within this specific panel might not universally apply, and extended research involving multiple panels could yield different conclusions in different contexts. The scope and generalizability of the findings should thus be approached with caution. Despite these limitations, the study offers valuable insights within its defined context, laying a foundation for further exploration and emphasizing the need for diverse perspectives in future research endeavors.

The insights derived from this Delphi-based analysis bear significant implications for both academia and destination marketing organizations. Destination management organizations can leverage the findings to enhance their strategic planning for tourism recovery. The study's outcomes offer a roadmap for crafting strategies for recovery campaigns that address negative perceptions, rebuild trust, and enhance the destination's image. By aligning their communication strategies with the identified key message features, DMOs can better navigate the complexities of post-crises recovery.

The study addresses a notable gap in the literature by conducting a long-term analysis of image restoration strategies. This emphasis on sustained recovery efforts over the years provides a foundation for future research and encourages a more comprehensive understanding of the evolving dynamics of destination marketing in the face of recurrent crises.

6. References

- Avraham, E. (2015). 'Destination image repair during crisis: attracting tourism during the Arab Spring uprisings,' *Tour. Manag.*, 47, pp. 224–232.

- Avraham, E. (2016). 'Destination marketing and image repair during tourism crises: The case of Egypt.' *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Management*, 28, pp.41-48.
- Avraham, E. (2020). 'Nation branding and marketing strategies for combatting tourism crises and stereotypes toward destinations.' *Journal of Business Research*, 116, pp. 711–720.
- Avraham, E. and Ketter, E. (2017). 'Destination image repair while combatting crises: Tourism marketing in Africa.' *Tourism Geographies*, 19(5), pp.780-800.
- Baalbaki, J. and Zizka, L. (2023). 'Egyptian crises and destination brand image: the resurrection of the mummy.' *Current Issues in Tourism*, pp.1-19.
- Backer, E. & Brent, W. (2017). 'VFR travel: a viable market for tourism crisis and disaster recovery?' *International Journal of Tourism Research*, 19(4), pp. 400-411.
- Becken, S. & Khazai, B. (2017.) 'Resilience, Tourism and Disasters' (Chapter 8), in: Richard W. Butler (Ed.), *Tourism and Resilience*, CAB International, Oxfordshire, UK.
- Becken, S. and Hughey, K.F. (2013). 'Linking tourism into emergency management structures to enhance disaster risk reduction.' *Tourism Management*, 36, pp. 77-85.
- Beirman, D. (2016). 'Safety and security in tourism–recovery marketing after crises,' *J. Policy Res. Tour., Leis. Events* (2016), pp. 98–106.
- Benoit, W. L. (1995). *Accounts, Excuses, And Apologies: A Theory of Image Restoration Strategies*. State University of New York Press.
- Biran, A., Liu, W., Li, G., & Eichhorn, V. (2014). 'Consuming post-disaster destinations: The case of Sichuan, China.' *Annals of Tourism Research*, 47, pp. 1-17.
- Cheng, J. W., Mitomo, H., Otsuka, T., & Jeon, S. Y. (2015). 'The effects of ICT and mass media in post-disaster recovery—a two model case study of the Great East Japan Earthquake.' *Telecommunications Policy*, 39(6), pp. 515-532.
- Coombs, W. (2014). *Ongoing Crisis Communication: Planning, Managing, and Responding*. Sage Publications, California, USA.
- Egypt Independent. (2023). Various Articles. Retrieved from <https://egyptindependent.com/>. (Accessed on 28 November 2023).
- ETN (ETurboNews). (2023). World Tourism Network. Retrieved from <http://www.eturbonews.com>. (Accessed on 1 December 2023).
- Fakhry, N.A.M. (2022). 'Advertising strategies for maintaining nation brand equity in times of crisis “Egyptian tourism advertising campaigns as a model”.' *International Design Journal*, 12(5), pp. 243-260.
- Faulkner, B. (2001). 'Towards a framework for tourism disaster management.' *Tour. Manag.*, 22(2001), pp. 135–147.
- Fountain, J., & Cradock-Henry, N. A. (2020). 'Recovery, risk and resilience: Post-disaster tourism experiences in Kaikōura, New Zealand.' *Tourism Management Perspectives*, 35, 100695.
- Garrod, B., & Fyall, A. (2005). 'Revisiting Delphi: the Delphi technique in tourism research.' *Tourism research methods: Integrating theory with practice*, 85.
- Gotham, K. F. (2017). 'Touristic disaster: spectacle and recovery in post-Katrina New Orleans.' *Geoforum*, 86, pp. 127-135.
- Hall, E. (2009). 'The Delphi primer: Doing real-world or academic research using a mixed-method approach.' *The refractive thinker*, 2, pp. 3-27.
- Handler, I. (2016). 'The impact of the Fukushima disaster on Japan's travel image: An exploratory study on Taiwanese travellers.' *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Management*, 27, pp. 12-17.
- Hassan, A.S. (2019). 'Evaluating the marketing communication strategy of Volkswagen in post-crisis period: application of image repair theory.' *International Journal of Marketing Studies*, 11(2), pp. 87-101.
- Hasson, F., Keeney, S., & McKenna, H. (2000). 'Research guidelines for the Delphi survey technique.' *Journal of advanced nursing*, 32(4), pp.1008-1015.
- Huang, Y.C., Tseng, Y.P., & Petrick, J.F. (2008). 'Crisis management planning to restore tourism after disasters: A case study from Taiwan.' *Journal of Travel & Tourism Marketing*, 23(2-4), pp. 203-221.
- Isaac, R. K., & Van den Bedem, A. (2021). 'The impacts of terrorism on risk perception

- and travel behaviour of the Dutch market: Sri Lanka as a case study.' *International Journal of Tourism Cities*, 7(1), pp. 63-91.
- Karimi, M.S., Khezri, M., & Razzaghi, S. (2022). 'Impacts of regional conflicts on tourism in Africa and the Middle East: a spatial panel data approach.' *Current Issues in Tourism*, 25(10), pp. 1649-1665.
 - Khazai, B., Mahdavian, F., & Platt, S. (2018). 'Tourism Recovery Scorecard (TOURS)– Benchmarking and monitoring progress on disaster recovery in tourism destinations.' *International Journal of Disaster Risk Reduction*, 27, pp. 75-84.
 - Le, D., & Phi, G. (2021). 'Strategic responses of the hotel sector to COVID-19: Toward a refined pandemic crisis management framework.' *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, 94, p.102808.
 - Lin, V.S., Liu, A., & Song, H. (2015). 'Modeling and forecasting Chinese outbound tourism: An econometric approach.' *Journal of Travel & Tourism Marketing*, 32(1-2), pp. 34-49.
 - Maher, N., & El Fkharany, H. M. (2022). 'Marketing Destinations Through Image Repair and Tourist Identity: An Evaluation Study Of Destination Management Organizations (DMOs) In Egypt.' *Journal of the Faculty of Tourism and Hotels-University of Sadat City*, 6(1), pp. 52–65.
 - Mair, J., Ritchie, B.W., & Walters, G. (2016). 'Towards a research agenda for post-disaster and post-crisis recovery strategies for tourist destinations: A narrative review.' *Current issues in tourism*, 19(1), pp. 1-26.
 - McCleary, K.W., & Whitney, D.L. (1994). 'Projecting western consumer attitudes toward travel to six Eastern European countries.' *Global tourist behavior*, pp. 239-256.
 - Ministry of Tourism & Antiquities. (2023). Various Articles. Retrieved from <https://mota.gov.eg>. (Accessed on 30 November 2023).
 - Novelli, M., Burgess, L.G., Jones, A., & Ritchie, B.W. (2018). '“No Ebola... still doomed”–The Ebola-induced tourism crisis.' *Annals of Tourism Research*, 70, pp. 76-87.
 - Okoli, C., & Pawlowski, S.D. (2004). 'The Delphi method as a research tool: an example, design considerations and applications.' *Information & management*, 42(1), pp. 15-29.
 - Oliveira, A., & Huertas, A. (2019). 'How do destinations use twitter to recover their images after a terrorist attack?' *Journal of destination marketing & management*, 12, pp. 46-54.
 - Ou, J., & Wong, I.A. (2021). 'Strategic crisis response through changing message frames: a case of airline corporations.' *Current Issues in Tourism*, 24(20), pp. 2890-2904.
 - Pan, T., Shu, F., Kitterlin-Lynch, M., & Beckman, E. (2021). 'Perceptions of cruise travel during the COVID-19 pandemic: Market recovery strategies for cruise businesses in North America.' *Tourism Management*, 85, p.104275.
 - Penco, L., Profumo, G., Remondino, M., & Bruzzi, C. (2019). 'Critical events in the tourism industry: Factors affecting the future intention to take a cruise.' *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*, 31(9), pp. 3547-3566.
 - Plummer, R., & Armitage, D. R. (2007). 'Charting the new territory of adaptive co-management: a Delphi study'. *Ecology and society*, 12(2).
 - Poon, W. C., & Koay, K. Y. (2021). 'Hong Kong protests and tourism: Modelling tourist trust on revisit intention.' *Journal of Vacation Marketing*, 27(2), pp. 217-234.
 - Ritchie, B.W., & Jiang, Y. (2019). 'A review of research on tourism risk, crisis, and disaster management: Launching the annals of tourism research curated collection on tourism risk, crisis and disaster management.' *Annals of Tourism Research*, 79, p.102812.
 - Ritchie, B.W., & Jiang, Y. (2021). 'Risk, crisis and disaster management in hospitality and tourism: a comparative review.' *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*, 33(10), pp. 3465-3493.
 - Ryu, K., Bordelon, B. M., & Pearlman, D. M. (2013). 'Destination-image recovery process and visit intentions: Lessons learned from Hurricane Katrina.' *Journal of Hospitality Marketing & Management*, 22(2), pp. 183-203.
 - Scott, N., Laws, E., & Prideaux, B. (2008). 'Tourism crises and marketing recovery strategies.' *Journal of Travel & Tourism Marketing*, 23(2-4), pp.1-13.
 - Singh, A., & Sahu, P. (2022). 'Reflecting on the Impact of COVID-19 on Tourism in Italy.'

- International Journal of Scientific Research and Management (IJSRM)*, 10, pp. 1066-1071.
- Singh, S., Nicely, A., Day, J., & Cai, L.A. (2022). 'Marketing messages for post-pandemic destination recovery-A Delphi study.' *Journal of Destination Marketing & Management*, 23, p.100676.
 - Szpilko, D. (2014). 'The use of Delphi method in the process of building a tourism development strategy in the region.' *Ekonomia i Zarządzanie*, 6(4), pp. 329-346.
 - Taecharungroj, V., & Avraham, E. (2022). 'From tsunami through terror attacks to Covid-19: Crisis communication strategies and recovery campaigns to combat Thailand's tourism crises.' *Asian Journal of Communication*, 32(1), pp. 41-64.
 - Ulmer, R.R., Seeger, M.W., & Sellnow, T.L. (2007). 'Post-crisis communication and renewal: Expanding the parameters of post-crisis discourse.' *Public relations review*, 33(2), pp. 130-134.
 - Walters, G., & Mair, J. (2012). 'The effectiveness of post-disaster recovery marketing messages—The case of the 2009 Australian bushfires.' *Journal of Travel & Tourism Marketing*, 29(1), pp. 87-103.
 - Walters, G., & Mair, J. (2014). 'Post-disaster recovery marketing for tourist destinations.' In S. McCabe (Ed.), *The Routledge handbook of tourism marketing*, pp. 461-472. Routledge.
 - Wang, F. and Lopez, C. (2020). 'Does communicating safety matter?' *Annals of Tourism Research*, 80, p.102805.
 - Yeh, S.S. (2021). 'Tourism recovery strategy against COVID-19 pandemic'. *Tourism Recreation Research*, 46(2), pp. 188-194.
 - Zhang, H., Song, H., Wen, L. and Liu, C. (2021). 'Forecasting tourism recovery amid COVID-19'. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 87, p.103149.
 - Zheng, D., Luo, Q. and Ritchie, B.W. (2021). 'Afraid to travel after COVID-19? Self-protection, coping and resilience against pandemic travel fear'. *Tourism Management*, 83, p.104261.