

## **A Successful Public -Private Partnership (PPP) Model for Attraction Site Management and Protection: The Case Study of the Giza Pyramids Renovation Project**

**Dalia Amara**

**Associate Professor - Graduate School of Business  
Arab Academy for Science, Technology and Maritime Transport, Egypt**

**Soha Bahgat**

**Associate Professor - Tourism Studies Department  
The Higher Institute of Specific Studies, Giza**

### **Abstract**

The occurrence of negative incidents in attraction sites, not only threatens the continued economic viability of the attraction site, but also affects the sustainable management of these sites. The Supreme Council of Antiquities (SCA) is planning to sustainably and inclusively develop and expand culture tourism. Over the past years, there has been a focus on developing Egypt's tourism infrastructure in order to attract investments, while the large size of the population has given an urge to socio-economic development projects. Since the lack of financing and modern management system can constitute an obstacle for the government to develop and/or manage such projects, the Public-Private Partnership (PPP) may be an optimum solution. The study aim is to explore the opinions of key stakeholders on the success factors, as well as the level of involvement and limitations of (PPP) for one of the most important cultural heritage assets

of Egypt" the Pyramids of Giza". A qualitative approach analysis that involved semi-structured interviews was applied to collect the data. Results show that managerial and operational factors are the most significant factors that affect the successful implementation of (PPP), followed by legal, political and financial factors.

**Keywords:** public-private partnership, attraction site, sustainable, cultural heritage, pyramids.

### **1. Introduction**

City growth is having a profound impact on ecosystems, as well as on natural landscapes and cultural heritage. These problems seem to be endemic in developing countries, where governments are facing socio-economic pressures, which makes it difficult to maintain the stability of sustainable development. However, many these countries have a great

legacy of both natural and historic monuments. The conservation of the vast historic legacy of certain areas is a key factor in attaining sustainable development. Regional and urban planners in countries like India, China and the African continent need to reflect on how the economic driving forces influencing the human impact on its environment can be reconciled with its conservation. One of the emerging factors that is affecting cultural and natural landscapes within the framework of economic development is tourism. However, the consequences of tourism on cultural heritage must be analyzed very carefully within a synergy of different disciplines (Vaz et al., 2009, 2010). In addition, mismanaged urban growth may have direct negative impacts not only on quality of life, but also on economic growth. In recent decades, ecologically – and archaeologically – rich sites have become vulnerable areas, due to urban expansion and infrastructure development. A rational identification of sustainable planning options calls for an integrated multi-level perspective on visitor management systems, in which the consequences of the behavior of conflicting actors are mapped out in a systemic way, e.g. by identifying the various stakeholders (Vaz, E. et al., 2011).

## 2. Cultural Tourism Development in Egypt

Since tourism in Egypt, needs to rethink its competitive advantage and prepare for short – and long – term demand shocks and shifts in traveler flows. A narrow focus on attracting a maximum number of budget tourists did drive strong growth at one point, but with it comes extensive risks, notably breakneck competition, environmental exploitation, and unhealthy investment bubbles; policies that

drive stable inbound tourism growth (Ringbeck, J. and Pietsch, T., 2013).

There is an immediate need to invest in the conservation and maintenance of Egypt's unparalleled cultural heritage assets, as well as the diversification of cultural tourism experiences and destinations. Cultural tourists generally spend more money and consume more domestic services, as they most often use multiple hotels, tour guides, and domestic transportation, and interact more directly with local populations, all in pursuit of a unique travel experience. Policymakers and tourism industry leaders need to take advantage of Egypt's competitive advantage and identify and leverage the cultural attributes that make Egyptian destinations distinctive. Solutions such as site bundling/clustering or promoting "multi-destination tourism" to provide the more complete "Egypt experience" that visitors are seeking have to be proposed. The key for Egypt is to better segment the market for higher – value forms of tourism, including cultural tourism in order to capture increasing market shares (USAID activity report, 2018).

## 3. Sustainable Development for Egypt Cultural Attraction Sites

Attraction sites of significant cultural importance which lose their original function become derelict, misused or even left to the mercy of general public. The economic perspective of cultural tourism can be defined as the way by which the cultural significant community can do economic development achievements by marketing its cultural potentials. Actually it acts in two compatible ways, the first draws the linkage between cultural tourism and economic development, and the second emphasizes the cultural sustainability as the guarantee for achieving cultural tourism assets within the conservation development concepts. Sustainability as a

conceptual understanding constitutes the framework within which cultural attraction sites could be addressed. However, it is important to sustain the cultural features that shape these valuable assets. It could be developed, upgraded and/or renovated to create a new interactive adapted image for their original one (El Menchawy,A.,and Hussein.(2012).

Egypt faces several challenges in managing its vast and diverse cultural assets, including a lack of effective and sustainable management plans for many cultural heritage sites. Policies conflicts and priorities among authorities, limit not only effective protection/conservation of the sites, but also the extent to which people in local and surrounding communities, can benefit economically from cultural tourism. Many potential areas are not included on Egypt's tourism development map due to lack of infrastructure upgrading, limited private investment, and inadequate public sector capacity and resources to protect and present these cultural heritage sites appropriately. Another issue is the sharp division between public services that are provided for community development and public investments that are made to protect cultural heritage sites, which separate the sites from local communities and their local contexts. Modern urbanization often results in a loss of unique traditional architecture, authenticity and value. Other challenges include limited public awareness of the potential economic value of cultural assets leading to a general lack of stakeholder involvement in the planning and managing of cultural tourism destinations. Although there is substantial will to address these and other challenges, government institutions lack appropriate systems, qualified human power, and the processes needed to effectively and efficiently

capitalize on the available resources (Curristine, T.et al,2007).

The private sector has invested heavily in beach and mass tourism, but opportunities for private investment in and adaptive reuse of cultural heritage assets is still limited. Several successful models have offered learning opportunities but they remain experimental and donor supported. Private expertise in addition to creative and locally driven solutions may help in sustainable managing, restoring, preserving and promoting Egypt's cultural assets. This may attract sustainable investment tourism projects in Egypt (USAID activity report, 2018).

El-Enany said (2020) the collaboration directed more investments to touristic development and provided a model for investment projects to operate attractive and efficient services for visitors to major touristic destinations in Egypt. "It also confirms the success of the ministry's vision in developing and operating services in historic sites, enhancing their cultural value and diversifying Egyptian touristic products while adding new cultural tourism destinations.

#### **4. Importance of Public-Private Partnership (PPP)**

The scope and ambition of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development call for the private sector to apply its creativity, resources and potential to bring innovative solutions to sustainable development challenges. Private sector actors are increasingly adopting approaches and business models that focus on profitable solutions to sustainable development challenges by targeting new markets and customers, redefining productivity and creating positive outcomes for the communities in which they work for (Vaes,S. and Huyse,H.,2015).

A public- private partnership refers to “arrangements, typically medium to long term, between the public and private sectors whereby some of the services that fall under the responsibilities of the public sector are provided by the private sector, with clear agreement on shared objectives for delivery of public infrastructure and/ or public services” (World Bank, 2016. pp.139, 188, 189). The European Union considers this kind of projects as anti-crises tool projects (Tigu et al., 2008).

It has been described different PPP models in which responsibilities and risks are allocated between the public and private partners in various ways. The differences between these models depend on the involvement of the public and private sector in the project. Consequently, the traditional public sector procurement takes place where the government has full responsibility, that is, the government is the owner, operator, and financier. As the private sector involvement and responsibility increases, PPP procurement methods start to take place until the private sector has complete responsibility over the project whereby the private sector is the owner, contractor, and operator (United Nations Economic Commission, 2008)

PPP Contract set out the rights and obligations of the parties, including technical and output specifications, service and performance standards, methodology for periodic adjustment of availability payments, monitoring and reporting procedures, and dispute resolution mechanisms, performance deductions, termination and compensation procedures. Under the PPP agreement, since infrastructure plays an important role of the overall economic development of any country, the emergence of the concept of the PPP where both the Government and Private Sector work jointly for the development of

high quality infrastructure is tackled. The Government secures new infrastructure, which becomes Government assets at the end of contract life Project and performance risks are allocated to the party best able to manage or mitigate. This may include changes in delivery mechanisms, processes, procedures and institutional structures to be tailored towards client- focused outcomes and results. In conclusion, PPP is a new source of investment capital for required infrastructure projects, helping to reduce Government sovereign borrowings and associated risks. In addition to, its role in expanding economy and stimulating job creation as well as, increasing quality of public services to the community (FAO and the OECD report, 2014).

According to previous literature, PPP overcomes the weaknesses of the public system (inefficiency; inflexibility; not responding to market needs; not autonomous and so on) (Tilak,J., 2016). PPP leads to the proper use or maximization of the private sector’s skills, experience, technology, and innovation as well as increasing the quality of public facilities and services (Tang et al.2010; Laing et al.2011). PPP provides the private sector with a mean to reduce risk, secure, long-term investment opportunities that are guaranteed by government contracts. Such arrangements provide investment opportunities, and stimulate local industry and job markets (Colverson and Perera, 2011).Risks are allocated to party best able to manage them. Consequently, public sector focuses on strategy, rather than operational tasks; this enables public managers to address key issues and not disperse with non-significant problems. Furthermore, a single contract with one entity increases transparency and it is easier to manage and control (Sarmiento and Rennebog, 2016).

It is not only the financial incentive that would make a government resort to implementing PPP in public service sector, but PPP is one of the appropriate means to develop this sector because of its high capacity for modernization and development as well as transfer of modern technology. This goal can be achieved especially in developing countries by including certain provisions. For instance, requiring the project company to acquire the latest technology in the field of work and allocate part of its profits for research and development, and to commit to continuous training of national labor and the use of national companies in construction operations, implementation and supply of production requirements (Ossman, 2019).

## **5. The Pyramids Development Project – PPP & The Egyptian Experience**

### **5.1 Public-Private Partnership in Egypt**

The Cabinet drafted amendments to the “Regulation of Private Sector Participation in Infrastructure Projects, Public Services and Utilities” promulgated in 2010. The draft was submitted to the parliament in December 2019, and states that administrative entities are allowed to enter into contracts with “the project’s company” to carry out specific tasks. Those include financing, developing, and designing, constructing, operating /leasing, rehabilitating and maintaining the project. The duration of the partnership contract shall not be less than five years and no more than 30 years starting the issuance date of the “approval certificate” by the administrative entity endorsing the quality level of work, products, or services provided. The value of the contract shall not be less than LE100 million, and a license is required if the duration of the contract is more than 15 years. Projects to be accomplished in the PPP system must be offered in tenders. Exceptions can be

made after the approval of the Supreme Committee for Partnership Affairs and the endorsement of the Central Unit for Partnership upon the request of the administrative entity (Egypt Today, 2020).

### **5.2 Orascom Investment Holding (OIH) and Pyramids Renovation Project**

The Giza plateau comprises the great pyramids of Khufu, Khafre and Menkaure, eight subsidiary pyramids, and numerous tombs. The Sphinx, situated in this complex, was carved from residual Upper Mokkatam limestone (Gauri, 1984), formed in the middle Eocene and abundant in the plateau’s core. Evidence shows the rapid disintegration of the limestone material (Tanimoto et al., 1995). Disintegration is a consequence of degradation due to pollution from surrounding urban areas, which form an enclave around the plateau. Understanding the importance of the area from a socio-economic perspective means appreciating the value of the Pyramid Complex as a unique architectural heritage feature, which is being adversely affected by the proximity of creeping urban sprawl, and endangered by air pollution and urban land-use change (Vaz, E. et al., 2011). Because of the evident deterioration of the pyramid plateau in the 1990s, the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) engaged in a joint effort to preserve the plateau and redefine the use and availability of infrastructures within the area. The master plan to improve the surrounding area was intended to achieve determined objectives by the end of 2016. The site was “unsafe, unclean, lacking even basic facilities like ATMs and trash cans. The gradual urban sprawl of modern Cairo began encroaching on the ancient majesty of the pyramids area, which had long stood preserved in the desert. UNESCO named the Giza pyramids a World Heritage in 1979, but

in subsequent years they were threatened by illegal construction and rapidly expanding neighboring slums in what is now known as 'El Haram ( the Pyramids)' District, vehicle pollution and unfettered tourism (Hawas,2000).

Planning to start its engagement in this sector by focusing on the Giza Pyramids plateau, Orascom Investment Holding intends to create a globally inspiring, innovative, and integrated destination that will encapsulate the entire Giza Plateau with top-end amenities and overwhelming human experiences that are truly fit for the magnitude and legacy of the Pyramids. Through visitor services and amenities coupled with state of the art technologies and site management systems, OIH is set to develop archeological sites and transform their visitors' experiences attracting the world's attention to the magnificent antiquities and great civilization of Egypt.

With the exponential growth that the tourism sector has witnessed over the past few years and the job opportunities it has created with it, OIH believes in the power of the industry to revive the Egyptian economy. OIH aims to transform visitors' experiences at historical sites and cultural venues, turning them into entertainment havens. Leveraging Egypt's wealth of historical and archaeological sites, Orascom Investment Holding has an ambitious plan to lead in this domain through introducing first-class hospitality and visitor services, cutting-edge technologies and state-of-the-art management and operational models.

Land-use maps as such, have become increasingly important tools to understand land-use changes as well to improve the potential of regional and urban planning, especially in Third World countries where lack of both data and a cross transdisciplinary

approach may hinder sustainable development strategies (Bocco et al., 2001). A clear tendency of loss of vegetation to the built environment could be observed. Furthermore, the district of Nazlet el Samman showed an increasing growth rate, suggesting the further endangerment of the Pyramid Complex of Giza (Vaz, E.et al., 2011).

With a need to renovate one of the most important historic attraction site in the world. The Supreme Council of Antiquities (SCA) has signed a contract with Orascom Investment Holding (OIH) on December 13, 2018, to provide and operate high-quality services and facilities at the area surrounding the Pyramids of Giza, retaining the council's authority over the area. This type of PPP is known as (OMM), Operations, Maintenance, and Management agreement where the contractor operates, maintains and manages an existing facility owned by the government.

The PPP concession has been awarded through a direct agreement. The agreement proposal was presented and approved by the Council of Ministers; as direct contracting is sometimes possible if some conditions apply. Those including the necessity to accomplish a certain project as mandated by national interest. The outstanding performance of the contractor in such PPP projects, putting forward a proposal that is creative and fulfilling the national interest, coupled with all technical and financial studies are needed.

The authority is entitled to a fixed amount of 10% per annum up to the end of the project term, as a guaranteed annual minimum; or an amount equivalent to 50% of Orascom Development Egypt's (ODE) forthcoming net profit. OIH's services are set to include holding promotional campaigns for the archaeological landmark, managing operations in the parking area located around

the entrance of El Fayoum road, providing an internal transportation network for visitors. The giant company will also manage operations of the site's visitor center, which will encompass shops, cafeterias, and a cinema, offering various types of services such as free Wi-Fi, signage, and visitor maps, amongst others. In addition to offering 20 golf carts and 20 mobile toilets. The contract was signed following the cabinet's approval, after almost a year of negotiations, and it aims to enhance the services available to the pyramids' visitors.

This contract retains the council's full control over the area, noting that the council is the only body that receives revenues from the tickets and bus services inside the plateau, which will be part of the ticket price in the future. In addition, the Tourism and Antiquities Police and the Supreme Council of Antiquities (SCA) guards are the only ones to secure the whole area, the visitors and the archaeological site. As the security provided by OIH will only be present to safeguard the places where services are provided.

## 6. Methodology

Qualitative research methodology is used to develop a theory, or describe the nature of an individual's experience (Fetters et al., 2013). Exploratory study was conducted since few earlier studies referred to PPP tourism projects in Egypt. An exploratory study is particularly useful to clarify our understanding of an issue, problem or phenomenon and it has the advantage of being flexible and adaptable to change (Saunders, 2016).

### 6.1 Study Population

The target population for this research was selected based on three main criteria ;(i) they must possess adequate knowledge on the area of PPP projects in tourism ; (ii) they have

followed very closely the development of PPP projects in tourism; or (iii) they have had a hands-on experience with PPP projects in tourism. As for the sample, it was selected using snowball sampling. First, an initial group of respondents was selected, at random. After being interviewed, those respondents were asked to identify others who belong to the target population of interest, i.e. subsequent respondents were selected based on the referrals. The researchers aimed to ensure that the sample of the study was representative of all sectors that would have part in PPP projects, i.e., public sector, private sector and development partner. The sample size for the interview consisted of 14 respondents.

### 6.2 Data collection

Interviews were held with experts in the tourism field in Egypt to obtain data on their point of view about the factors that lead to resort to PPP in tourism, barriers to this implementation and the success factors for its implementation. According to Bryman (2011), semi- structured interviews not only consist of some leading questions that help to tackle the areas to be explored, but also allow the interviewer to request for elaboration in order to pursue an idea or response in detail. Consequently, semi-structured interviews were the instrument developed for data collection of the study.

All data obtained during interviews was recorded either written or through audio recording. The fact that interviews produce detailed information from informants, the researchers utilized the interactive nature of the interview to improve their understanding of the informants' replies. The researchers had the opportunity to clarify any misinterpretations, hence allowing the informants to respond thoroughly and

sometimes to raise any interesting points that were not anticipated by the researchers while preparing the interview questions. Probing was done by asking questions such as "why do you say that?", "can you tell me more about this point?" or "would you like to add anything else?" Since the interviews participants are considered experts, they were expected to add, modify or stressed some main concepts towards the project in hand as well as getting an in-depth exploration of their experience in order to ascertain the factors that lead to resort to PPP in tourism, clarifying barriers and successful implementation as well.

The interview questions followed an interview guide format, divided into two sections. The first section focused on factors that lead to resort to PPP in tourism in Egypt, barriers to its implementation, what a successful PPP project is and the interviewees' experience in PPP in tourism. In the second section, questions were mainly open-ended that focused on discussing the critical success factors for PPP implementation in tourism in Egypt.

Participant observational research took place while visiting the project site itself nine month before the announcement of the inauguration ceremony for the Pyramids renovation project. It was recognized the distinctive capabilities of observational methodologies for investigating the enhancement results, leading to a better visitor experience and consequently more local economic benefits.

### **6.3 Data analysis**

The interviews' raw data obtained were analyzed to fill the literature gap. The original quotations were subsequently analyzed using conventional qualitative content analysis technique. Themes were recognized from the answers according to the repeated words and

ideas. The interviews were analyzed using thematic and content analyses with extracted codes from NVIVO software, which is designed to analyze qualitative data.

#### **6.3.1 Thematic Analysis for Interviews Questions**

Using thematic analysis, the interviews collected were analyzed and the respondents' answers were investigated. Throughout the answers of the interviewees, the researchers evaluated the responses in the interview in order to obtain the main themes that could be extracted for this research. Scanning the responses, the researchers observed that the answers of the interviewees are diversified into different aspects such as financial, managerial and operational aspects. Data were read word by word to derive codes by first highlighting the exact words from the text that appear to capture key thoughts or concepts. The content of the interviews were analyzed more deeply, selecting the most repeated words, and then grouping these codes into categories. Afterwards, related categories were merged to organize and group codes into clusters to come up with the research main theme.

#### **6.3.2 Content Analysis**

Content analysis was employed to examine the nature, level and restrictions of private sector's involvement. Content analysis uses an objective, systematic approach to measure the meaning of communicated material through the classification and evaluation of selected words, themes or concepts. It goes beyond merely counting words to examining language intensely for classifying large amounts of text into an efficient number of categories that represent similar meanings (Gheyle,N.,and Jacobs,T,2017) . Conducting a successful content analysis requires careful



|  |            |                |    |    |      |
|--|------------|----------------|----|----|------|
|  |            | Country        | 7  | 46 | 0.24 |
|  |            | Entity         | 6  | 17 | 0.20 |
|  |            | Ministry       | 8  | 17 | 0.20 |
|  | Management | Success        | 7  | 86 | 0.83 |
|  |            | Role           | 4  | 70 | 0.58 |
|  |            | Responsibility | 14 | 34 | 0.34 |
|  |            | Management     | 10 | 42 | 0.21 |

Meanwhile , the category “Economic” had codes such as needs, factors, revenue, opportunities, industry and development , while the codes of investment, project, funding investor ,financial and profit were

merged in the category of “Finance”. Finally, all related categories were integrated into one theme representing the main themes of the current research.

**Table 2: Word Frequencies for Economic and Financial Factors Theme**

| Themes                         | Categories | Codes         | Length | Count | Weighted Percentage (%) | Total |
|--------------------------------|------------|---------------|--------|-------|-------------------------|-------|
| Economic and Financial Factors | Economic   | Factors       | 7      | 145   | 0.70                    | 5.82  |
|                                |            | Needs         | 5      | 42    | 0.43                    |       |
|                                |            | Opportunities | 8      | 38    | 0.41                    |       |
|                                |            | Industry      | 8      | 28    | 0.33                    |       |
|                                |            | Revenue       | 6      | 32    | 0.38                    |       |
|                                |            | Development   | 11     | 58    | 0.33                    |       |
|                                | Finance    | Investment    | 10     | 64    | 0.53                    |       |
|                                |            | Project       | 7      | 69    | 0.60                    |       |
|                                |            | Funding       | 12     | 74    | 0.71                    |       |
|                                |            | Investor      | 8      | 27    | 0.32                    |       |
|                                |            | Financial     | 9      | 21    | 0.25                    |       |
| Profit                         | 11         | 90            | 0.83   |       |                         |       |

## 7. Findings and Discussion

The results of the study assured that a decade-long effort to renovate the site of the pyramids was abruptly halted after the 2011 political revolution as tourism revenue across Egypt plunged. Representatives of Egypt’s new government explained that in 2016 work had resumed, overseen by a security and hospitality services company linked to the armed forces. The Supreme Council of Antiquities (SCA) was seeking to re-utilize, preserve, and develop Egypt’s historic areas in a sustainable manner, as well as to provide services to the visitors of these areas to enrich their cultural experience. Results revealed that

the rehabilitation of historic buildings after their restoration was one of the most important methods of preserving them, and it worked to raise their cultural and economic value, promoting such areas as new touristic and cultural destinations.

Interviewing Ayman Suleiman, CEO of the Sovereign Fund of Egypt (SFE), he valued the importance of the contract signed in October 2020, to develop and manage the provision of services to visitors to different historical areas such as the Bab al-Azab area. The (SCA) will solely manage this historic site, while the

(SFE) will manage the operations and services in the Bab Al-Azab area, reflecting the collaboration between the parties to revive the area and increase its historic and economic value. He explained that the (SFE) aims to boost sustainable economic development in Egypt through attracting private investments to contribute technically and financially to such projects in order to develop state assets, in accordance with best international practices, optimizing their returns and maximizing their long-term value for future generations.

(SFE) officials added that there was an urgent need to get a contract with private companies to maintain, secure and clean the area. A need to cooperate with the private investors to develop the Pyramids attraction site. The area would then offer visitors a rich cultural experience that featured the area's historic value and highlighted the pivotal events it had witnessed and its role in Egypt's modern history, they said.

According to local archaeologists, and tour operators, many of them have lost faith in the state's ability to run properly such an important touristic site. They resumed their opinion referring to the former antiquities minister Zahi Hawas's criticism to the Giza Plateau as an "open zoo" filled with garbage and unlicensed vendors bothering tourists during their visit. They added that the Pyramids site renovation has been delayed repeatedly, and they have been waiting for such multimillion-dollar improvements for years, which will consequently with no doubt affect tourists' numbers and revenues positively.

Mr. Ashraf Mohi Eldin, the Director general of the Giza Pyramids area, started his conversation mentioning that renovating the site of Giza Pyramids set to cost around \$ 25

million , he stressed the ministry's vision to change the Pyramids attraction site to a better status and a reputable image, to welcome around 20,000 visitor per day. Such development project includes moving the entrance from nearby the Mena House hotel to El Fayoum road, so as all types of vehicles will pass through the main gate to a big parking lot. The pyramids' visitors will access a visitor information center to collect flyers and other printed materials giving all information needed, where as well a huge maquette to demonstrate the whole pyramids plateau site. A cinema projection hall will display a seven minutes documentary movie about the history and the excavations of the pyramids site, said Mr Ashraf. He also added that a riding area would be located outside the site for visitors looking for souvenir photos while riding camels or horses. Electric cars and multilingual audio guide are available .Restaurants and toilets are available with clear planned signage boards, guiding visitors to all required facilities and services as well as friendly, well-trained staff who will be ready to help them during their visit. An archeological training and awareness center for youth, and interested scholars will have the chance to participate in future programs related to archeology and monuments conservation.

Monica Hanna, an Egyptian archaeologist cites that public-private partnerships with no doubt serve as a great model for historic sites conservation, giving examples of successful conservation efforts of such partnerships in Italy .She added such arrangements are increasingly common among governments from San Francisco to Cambodia. Moreover, Hanna stressed the crucial need to change the idea in people's minds that 'antiquities and museums are as state -owned properties, and that government's priority is to cater to its

local community rather than tourists, expecting people and new generations to value their cultural heritage through awareness and education.

Speaking of PPP benefits, the chairman of the Egyptian tourism Federation explains that the role of the state should not be confined to participation, but to also include the elimination of obstacles embodied in corruption and disabling administrative procedures. An advantage of PPP is that such impediments would be absent. As usually, investors examine opportunities offered by the government, they pick projects that are properly valued, have corporate governance, transparency, and good representation. In spite of this, there is still no clear and/or planned programs for PPP projects in the field of tourism in Egypt yet, he added.

According to a travel agency's marketing manager, understanding tourism sites' preservation including environmental tips and visitors 'eco advice issues is all about awareness as a travel agency is often a source of information about tourists' responsibilities and responsible behavior. He believes that tourism industry driven best practices are going to be important in the future, thus business best practices' observation especially when it is concerned with heritage and historic assets is crucial. Most of the travel companies become more interested to work with trained guides to keep a vigilant watch on heritage tourists sightseeing. Conscious of the fact that it is the activities of tourists, which actively cause the harmful effects of tourism, some travel agents, have created codes of conduct to guide tourists towards more sustainable behavior.

Tourism officials suggest that, yet many travel companies in Egypt are not proactive in site attraction management approaches yet. They

do not have specific policy to be applied to their itinerary to such historic attraction sites.

According to Hisham Samir, assistant of Egyptian antiquities minister, to the Middle East News Agency (MENA), the \$500 million Pyramids Renovation Project was supposed to be launched for its visitors in the first quarter of 2020, apparently before the rapid spread of COVID-19 epidemic.

## 8. Implications and Recommendations

The efforts of the Egyptian government for developing an explicit policy to support and encourage PPP in all sectors of the economy are evident in many statements from Egypt's 2030 Vision. This study stressed a pioneer successful experience of PPP created through mutual efforts and agreement between both sectors. Other proposed tourism attraction sites are under advisement to follow clear and planned programs for PPP such as El Baron Palace, Hurghada Museum. In addition to other various projects including BabAl-Azab development project that would include a museum with interactive technologies, a market for spices, traditional crafts and foods, a design school, a theatre for traditional and cultural arts, as well as a historical library. The government can encourage the commissioning of such projects by overcoming resistance and by giving a clear indicator of the public sector's intention to meet its contractual commitments.

Recommendations come to support Egypt's competitiveness, with a broader and multidimensional approach by focusing on successful models of PPP in the field of tourism, which is with no doubt in parallel to increasing the economic benefits and revenue resulting from integrations among a consortium of expertise from different associated and complementing disciplines to

reach sustainable results. This could be achieved through;

- Developing skills to meet today's growing cultural tourism demands;
- Seeking economically viable models for private sector engagement integrated into adaptive reuse and protection of cultural resources;
- Diversifying cultural tourism products and services offered within the Egyptian market;
- Improving the promotion and marketing of cultural heritage destinations;
- Applying effective and efficient management techniques on cultural heritage assets achieved through collaborative, integrated, and sustainable systems;
- Improving conservation management, maintenance, and use of cultural heritage assets.

## 9. Conclusion

This study was intended to enhance understanding the successful effect of PPP implementation in the tourism sector in Egypt. The Pyramids development project was studied to guide research in this area .Giving assurance to reputable bidders (both local and foreign) that a due process is in place and that the government of Egypt is serious about following the program through an effective manner. Giving confidence to potential bidders will increase the number willing to participate, improving competition and thereby project performance.

## Abbreviation Table

|        |   |
|--------|---|
| (PPP)  | Public-Private Partnership                        |
| (SCA)  | The Supreme Council of Antiquities                |
| (OIH)  | Orascom Investment Holding                        |
| (OMM)  | Operations, Maintenance, and Management agreement |
| (ODE)  | Orascom Development Egypt                         |
| (SFE)  | The Sovereign Fund of Egypt                       |
| (MENA) | The Middle East News Agency                       |

## 10. References

- Bocco, G., Mendoza, M., Velázquez, A. (2001). Remote sensing and GIS-based regional geomorphological mapping – a tool for land use planning in developing countries, *Geomorphology* 39(3-4): 211-219.
- Bryman. (2011). *Business Research Methods*. (3rd Edition). Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Colverson, S., and Perera, O. (2011). 'Sustainable Development: Is there a role for public-private partnerships?' A summary of an IISD preliminary investigation. October 2011.
- Curristine, T.,Lonti,Z.and Joumard,I.(2007). *Improving Public Sector Efficiency: Challenges and Opportunities*. OECD Journal on Budgeting, Volume 7-No.1
- Egypt Today (Feb 2020). *Discerning Public-Private Partnership*. Available online from <https://www.egypttoday.com/Article/3/81446/Discerning-Public-Private-Partnership> (last accessed on 10/07/2020)
- Egypt Today (Dec 2018). *Orascom to Provide Tourist Facilities at Giza Pyramids*. Available online from <http://www.egypttoday.com/Article/1/62031/Orascom-Investment-Holding-to-provide-Giza-Pyramids-visitors-with-services> (last accessed on 10/11/2019)
- El Menchawy,A.,and Hussein.(2012). *Creating a tourism destination through sustainable development: case study coastal area of Abuqir, Alexandria, Egypt*. *Sustainability Today* (pp.423-434) Edition:1<sup>st</sup>

- Chapter: chapter 1: Sustainable development and planning Publisher: Southampton: WIT Press
- FAO and the OECD report. (2014). Opportunities for Economic Growth and Job Creation in relation to food security and nutrition. Available online from: [www.fao.org](http://www.fao.org) (last accessed on 22/02/2019).
  - Feters, M., Leslie A. Curry, & John W. Creswell. (2013). Achieving integration in mixed methods designs- principles and practices. Health services research 48. Wiley Online Library.
  - Gauri K.L., 1984, Geological study of the Sphinx, Newsletters of the American Research Center in Egypt, 127: 24-43.
  - Gheyle, N., and Jacobs, T. (2017). 'Content Analysis: a short overview. Ghent University Library. Belgium.
  - Hawas, Z., (2000). Site Management and Tourism, Available from: <http://www.guardians.net/hawass/conservation2.htm>. (Last accessed on 12/10/2019)
  - Ringbeck, J. and Pietsch, T. (2013). How to succeed as a Tourism Destination in a volatile world. The Travel & Tourism Competitiveness Report 43. chapter 1.2. Booz & Activity Company.
  - Kevin Coe, Joshua M. Scarco (2017). Content Analysis, Quantitative. John Wiley & Sons.
  - Laing, I., Partner, and Masons P. (2011). 'Introduction to Public Private Partnerships; Where and How to Select Investments', PPT (online). Available from: <https://slideplayer.com/slide/12721097/>. (Last accessed on 28 /12/ 2019)
  - Orascom Investment Holding (OIH) Destination Development. Available from: (<https://orascomih.com/en/entertainment/2018> ). (Last accessed on 24 /06/2020)
  - Patton, M. (2002). Qualitative Research and Evaluation Methods. 3rd ed. Sage. Thousand Oaks, CA.
  - Sarmiento J. M. and Renneboog L. (2016). 'Anatomy of public-private partnerships: their creation, financing and renegotiations'. International Journal of Managing Projects in Business, Vol. 9 Issue: 1, pp.94-122, <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJMPB-03-2015-0023>. Permanent link to this document: <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJMPB-03-2015-0023>
  - Saunders M., Lewis P., and Thornhill A. (2016). 'Research Methods for Business Students'. 7th Edition. Harlow, England: Financial Times, Prentice Hall.
  - Tang, L., Shen, Q. and Cheng, E. (2010) 'A review of studies on Public-Private Partnership projects in the construction industry', International Journal of Project Management 28 (2010) 683–694, Elsevier Ltd. 28.7: 683-694.
  - Tigu, G., Bulin, D. (2008). Public-Private Partnership a new path for tourism development. Academy of Economic Studies, Bucharest. Available online from [http://www.academia.edu/2386259/Public-Private-Partnership-a\\_new\\_path\\_for\\_tourism-development](http://www.academia.edu/2386259/Public-Private-Partnership-a_new_path_for_tourism-development) (last accessed on 08 /12/ 2020).
  - Tilak, J. (2016). 'Public Private Partnership in Education', Discussion Paper Series No. 3/2016, The Head Foundation Sri Untari, "Public-Private Partnerships in Improving the Quality of Education for the Poor in Indonesia", Public Policy and Administration Research, Vol.6, No.6, ISSN 2224-5731(Paper) ISSN 2225-0972(Online). Available from: [www.iiste.org](http://www.iiste.org)
  - Tesch, R. (1990). Qualitative research: Analysis types and software tools. Falmer Press. New York.
  - Tanimoto, C., Kishida, K., Onuma, E., Mori, K. (1995). The Salinization and Slaking of Egyptian Mokattam Limestone, *Journal of the Society of Materials Science* 44 (502): 862-868.

## المراجع العربية

- United Nations Economic Commission for Europe. (2008). 'Guide Book on Promoting Good Governance in Public Private Partnerships', Publication no. 08.11.E.1. New York and Geneva: United Nations, 2008.
- USAID Activity report (2018). Cultural Tourism Development in Egypt. RFI-263-19-00001. Available online from: [www.usaid.gov/egypt/cultural/tourism/development](http://www.usaid.gov/egypt/cultural/tourism/development) (last accessed on 29/11/2020).
- Vaes,S. and Huyse,H.(2015). Private sector in development cooperation. Mapping international debates, donor policies and Flemish Development Cooperation. Research Institute for work and society, Belgium.
- Vaz,E., Caetano, M., Nijkamp, P., (2011). A multi-level spatial urban pressure analysis of the Giza pyramid plateau in Egypt. Journal of Heritage Tourism.
- Vaz, E., Caetano, M., Nijkamp, P., (2010) (forthcoming). Trapped between antiquity and urbanism. A multi-criteria assessment model of the greater Cairo metropolitan area, Journal of Land Use Science.
- World Bank. (2016). 'Public Private Partnerships', World Bank Development Report. Washington, DC, pp.139, 188, 189. Available from: <http://worldbank.org/public-private-partnership/overview/what-are-public-private-partnership> (last accessed on 2/10/2019).
- World Bank. (2018). 'Procuring Infrastructure Public-Private Partnerships', World Bank Report, World Bank Group, PPP LRC, Washington, DC.
- سعيد عبد العزيز عثمان (٢٠١٩). "مشاركة القطاع الخاص في قطاع الخدمات العامة بين النظرية والتطبيق"، دار فاروس العلمية للنشر والتوزيع